

School Committee Program to Improve Teacher's Performance in the District of Cipayung City Administration East Jakarta (CIPP Model Evaluation Research)

¹Udit*, ²Zulela, ³Endry Boeriswati

¹Postgraduate Student, Jakarta State University Indonesia

²Lecturers, Jakarta State University, Indonesia

³Lecturers, Jakarta State University, Indonesia

Abstract

This research aims to evaluate the school committee program in improving the performance of Elementary School teachers in Cipayung sub-district. Method used evaluation study method with CIPP model. The results showed; (1). Context, the purpose of establishing a school committee consisting of channeling, responsible, transparent, accountable, and democratic. But there are no specific schedules to absorb the aspirations of the community, (2). Input, the implementation of recruitment of members of Cipayung Subdistrict School Committee is not fully done through the procedures established by the legislation, the Electoral Committee of prospective members of Cipayung Subdistrict School Committee is not formed and established by the principal but by members of the school committee of Cipayung Subdistrict, (3) Process, implementation of the function of the school committee, the implementation of the school committee duties, and the implementation of the school committee's role has been good, but schools have not maximally worked with the business and industrial World, (4) Product, performance enhancement consisting of better education services, completion of tasks, professionals in carrying out their roles and functions and improving student achievement. Conclusion has not been a similarity of concept of work and there are differences of perception about role and function of school committee.

Keywords: Committees, Improving, Performance, Programs, Schools.

Introduction

School committees are formed in each school as a result of Ministerial Decree No. 202 for decentralization. The committee is expected to work closely with school principals as partners to develop the quality of schools using the concepts of school-based management and community that are democratic, transparent and accountable.

Reality on the ground in particular Elementary School in Cipayung Subdistrict, East Jakarta Administration City, it was said that in its journey from 2002 to the present, the performance of the School Committee in Jakarta began to be questioned. Various problems arise in the body of the school committee, so that its role in overseeing the management and implementation of education is ineffective. The School Committee is considered not to have made a major contribution in improving education services in schools.

The school committee has not been able to optimally carry out the roles and functions as they should. The School committee does not have the critical power of educational policy in schools. This is due to the dominance of the role of the state (regional head) in making educational policy decisions in the regions, so politically the school committee does not need to get support from the local government both in the budget, infrastructure and human resources. The strong dominance of the role of regional head authority has placed school committees in a marginalized position in the processes and activities of education in schools.

The reason for choosing a Public Elementary School in the City of East Jakarta Administration as a place of research is based on several things, namely: based on the results of a preliminary study conducted by researchers, Elementary School City Administration of East Jakarta provides another picture of the existence of school committees, including school committees having an organizational structure, electing school

committee members through democracy, although they do not yet have an organization's statutes and by-laws, school committees have annual work programs, even though they do not have a budget program, the school committee signed the Curriculum and School Work Plan, even though it was not involved in its preparation.

There are several aspects that will be examined related to school committees including; context of the purpose of forming a school committee, input on the recruitment of school committee formation, the process of implementing the functions of the school committee, the implementation of the school committee's tasks, the role of the school committee, and improving teacher performance.

Literature Review Program Evaluation

The main understanding contained in the evaluation, one of which is there are standards, benchmarks or criteria. Evaluating means making an effort to collect data about the real condition of something compared to the criteria, to find out how far the gap exists between the real conditions and the criteria as expected conditions. According to Res and Maria (2016) that evaluation is an integral part of the teaching and learning process and the learning outcomes focus on being transformative in the community. Further according Carpenter et.al, (2016) that efforts in conducting analysis, collecting data in the field, and searching for various information in the field.

The same opinion was expressed by Fitzpatrick, Sanders and Worthen (2004) that is to include identifying, clarifying and applying criteria to determine the values of the object being evaluated. Cimmings and Worley (2015) explained that the evaluation was related to providing feedback to practitioners and members of the organization about the progress and impact of the intervention. Griffin and Moorhead (2014) said that the evaluation process requires quite a long time and requires the use of qualitative and quantitative information about performance.

Evaluation is also a process to distinguish between benefits and non-benefits, whether or not something. According to Alcamo (2017) that there are several parts of program evaluation including: (1) validity (indicators reflect what will be measured?); (2) reliability (how can indicators be measured consistently?); meaningfulness and understandability (indicators that are in conformity with the program and can be understood by program implementers?); (3) balance and completeness (do the indicators provide a balanced and comprehensive view of the program?); (4) timeliness and ability to act (indicators are provided in a timely manner and can respond to indicator values?); (5) degree of goal shift (is there an increase in performance indicators?); (6) practical considerations (indicators can be measured?).

School Committee

According to Dorval, Thornby, Ottman and Hubbard (2017) that to date, there have been a number of committee tasks such as reviewing syllabi, carrying out reform of curricular policies and integrating interprofessional education. The committee also refers to the committee curriculum. The curriculum of the committee plays an important role in the school. School committee interests and roles in education have evolved to address changes in the profession and accreditation.

This is supported by opinion Koç (2015) that it is important to encourage the Teacher Committee effectively for the efficiency of educational activities carried out in schools. For naming bodies adapted to the conditions and needs of the area of each educational unit, such as school committees, assemblies, school, kindergarten committees or other names agreed upon together. According to Sukirno (2006) said that based on the school committee work guide Chapter II Article 4 (four) it was explained that the position of the school committee was as an independent institution or organization outside the school organizational structure commonly called nonstructural organization, but it was an inseparable part of the school as a partner school.

Likewise according to Okitsu, and Edwards (2017) that at the school level allows the community and parents to participate in decision making and policy in schools. Through the role of government number 39 of 1992, about the role of the community in national education and Decree of the Minister of National Education No 044/U/2002 concerning the Establishment of the Education Board and School Committee, the essence of the two products issued by the government is that the role of the community is to participate in maintaining, growing, enhancing, and developing national education and aims to utilize the capabilities of

the community as optimal as possible to realize the goals of national education.

According to Mitchell (2017) that parents can be directly involved in school leadership so that part of parental participation in education. Parents can provide input on school policies.

Performance

According to Sony and Mekoth (2016) that performance, in general, refers to behavior that is relevant to organizational goals and under individual control. Similarly, according to Nadiah Ghani, et. al, (2016) that performance is one of the important elements that provides objectives and methods for achieving the organization's mission.

Teacher performance is considered very important because it will affect the quality and quality of education. Teachers must have motivation, commitment and competence to improve performance. Ohme and Zacher (2015) also said that performance is one of the most important outcomes in a work context, it has been defined as a measurable ability of work behavior that is under control and contributes to organizational goals.

Performance is the final result that is usually measured based on three criteria, namely the quantity and quality of products and services in the form of customer service levels. Further according Mohamad and Jais (2016) that performance is the total value expected of individuals in carrying out a job. In addition, each individual has the quality and quantity of work. This shows that individual performance is largely determined by motivation and desire and ability to do work.

In line with this opinion, Lado and Alonso (2017) also said that performance is defined as every behavior or activity carried out by a person must be able to be adjusted to the goals of the organization. According to Colquitt and Le Pine (2011) that performance is formally defined as values summarized in the behavior of both positive and negative teachers to achieve organizational goals.

CIPP Model

The reason for using the CIPP evaluation model is because; a) researchers can be useful providers of information to assess alternative decisions, b) help policy makers to assess and develop the benefits of educational programs or objects, c) help develop school committee policies and programs in Elementary School Jakarta, d) the school committee program is very appropriate to evaluate the CIPP model because the program will be evaluated in terms of context, input, process, product. According to Neyazi and Arabic (2016) that the CIPP model was developed by Danial L. Stufflebeam and his colleagues that CIPP stands for context,

input, process and product. According to Hasan et. al (2015) that the Stufflebeam evaluation model involves an evaluation process in the form of context, input, process and product.

1. Context Evaluation

Context evaluation is defined as a situation or background that influences the types of goals and strategies carried out in a given program. Evaluation of the dimensions of this evaluation context such as policies or related work units, targets to be achieved within a certain time, energy problems faced in the related work units and so on. According to Barnes, Fives and Dacey (2017) said that assessment serves as a guide for teachers and school committees in taking action and influences teachers in making decisions about using learning practices, strategies, instructional techniques and providing motivation to students.

2. Input Evaluation

Input evaluation basically has a goal to link the objectives, context, input, and process with the results of the program. Evaluation of this input is also to determine the suitability of the environment in helping to achieve the goals and objectives of the program, then according to Widyoko (2009) that the evaluation of this input is to help set decisions, determine available sources, what alternatives are taken, plans and strategies for achieving goals, and how the work procedures for achieving them. Stufflebeam and Shinkfield (2007) said evaluation inputs helped identify and assess procedural design strategies and programs to meet the assessment needs.

3. Process Evaluation

Process evaluation is a CIPP model that is directed to find out how far the activities are carried out, whether

the program is carried out according to plan or not. This process evaluation is also used to detect or predict procedure designs or implementation plans during the implementation phase, provide information for program decisions and as a record or archive of procedures that have been achieved. As for opinions Suharsimi (2004) propose questions in the process, among others, as follows; a) Is the program implementation in accordance with the schedule, b) Will those involved in the program implementation be able to handle the activities during the program? c) Are the facilities and infrastructure provided maximally utilized? d) What obstacles were encountered during the program implementation?. Stufflebeam and Shinkfield (2007) said the evaluation process involved documenting and evaluating the implementation of the chosen program strategy.

4. Product Evaluation

Stufflebeam and Shinkfield (2007) say product evaluation as follows, product evaluation requires finding out, analyzing and assessing the results of the program term factors such as targeted reach to recipients, effectiveness, side effects, sustainability and transportability. On evaluating the product the school committee's program focuses on program success with success criteria, producing quality graduates and the effectiveness of school committee work with success criteria, and improving the quality of school education.

Research Method

The method chosen in this study is a program evaluation research method. The components are evaluated by a model approach evaluation CIPP (Context, Inputs, Process, and Product), developed by Stufflebeam. The main data sources (key informants) in this study obtained data from teacher informants, school principals, school committees, the community, and the education office. From this information source several data collection methods will be carried out such as interviews, documentation and observation to get as much information as possible about the School Committee Program in Improving Teacher Performance Elementary School in Cipayang Subdistrict, East Jakarta Administration City.

Results and Discussion

1. Context

In the context aspects related to the purpose of forming a school committee consisting of channeling aspirations, responsibility, transparency, accountability, and democracy so that it can be explained below:

Channeling aspirations, School Committee Elementary School Cipayang Subdistrict channeled the aspirations of students' parents usually through the class community that was accommodated by the school committee at the elementary school level. All problems with education services in schools are conveyed through the classroom group management which is then communicated through the school committee. The activities of absorbing the aspirations of the community, especially schools, are carried out by the School Committee through monitoring and evaluation activities which consist of monitoring and evaluation of curriculum, monitoring and evaluation of facilities and infrastructure, monitoring and evaluation of educators and education staff, and monitoring and evaluation of the budget. In addition, the activities of collecting and analyzing complaints, suggestions, criticisms, and aspirations of the community towards education are also carried out based on direct community complaints at the School Committee secretariat which are conducted on a scheduled basis.

Responsibility, the School Committee is a non-profit and non-political body or institution, formed based on democratic deliberations by educational stakeholders at the level of the education unit as a representation of various elements responsible for improving the quality of educational processes and outcomes. Increasing the responsibility and participation of the community in the administration of education in the education unit. The school committee has a forum for transparency and accountability in every school's educational services to the community. School committees, usually delivered at school committee meetings to provide reports on school activities then delivered to the community.

Transparent, the school committee can create a transparent, accountable and democratic atmosphere and conditions in the organization and quality of education services in the education unit. So that the implementation of the budget in each education unit, especially the schools, is in accordance with the technical guidelines for its implementation and is managed transparently. As a form of implementing the School Committee's oversight function, monitoring and evaluation or monitoring and evaluation have been

carried out. So far, what has been done such as monitoring and evaluation various budget uses. The purpose of this monitoring and evaluation is to ensure that the implementation of the budget of the fund is in accordance with the existing technical guidelines and is actually managed transparently. The results of the monitoring and evaluation were made an analysis and evaluation which would later be submitted to the principal and related agencies.

Accountable, for the School Committee, the results of the improvement of policies and programs must also be disseminated to the public so that feedback occurs for the successful implementation of education. This is done with the aim that various policies and programs set by schools can be accountable to the community.

Democratic, the membership of the School Committee consists of elements of the community that can originate from; representatives of parents/guardians of students based on democratically chosen class levels, community leaders (cultural figures, traditional leaders, etc.), community members who have an interest or are used as figures and have an interest in improving the quality of education, local government officials,

experts education that has an interest in improving the quality of education, professionally selected educational professional organizations.

2. Input

In the context aspects related to the recruitment of forming a school committee can be explained that the recruitment of members of the Cipayung District School Committee was not fully carried out through procedures established by the existing laws and regulations. The recruitment of prospective members of the Cipayung District School Committee found problem conditions. First, the selection committee for prospective members of the Cipayung Sub-district School Committee was not formed and determined by the Principal but by the Demayer Cipayung Sub-district School Committee members. Second, prospective school committee members who register do not go through a fit and proper test as part of the recruitment or selection process. Third, there are prospective 'stealth' members or candidates who do not register as candidates for School Committee members but are determined as elected School Committee members and even the person concerned becomes one of the elements of the vice chairman. The number of prospective members of the School Committee who registered with the committee was actually 12 people but because it was added to those who did not go through the process to 13 people. Fourth, the nomination of prospective members of the School Committee to the Principal is not through consultation and recommendation of professional organizations in advance. However, it was also found that there were elements of the recruitment process carried out in accordance with applicable laws and regulations such as the announcement of registration of prospective members of the Cipayung District School Committee through the mass media.

3. Process

In the process aspect related to the implementation of school committee functions, the implementation of the duties of the school committee, and the implementation of the role of the school committee so that it can be explained below:

Implementation of the functions of the school committee which consists of: (a) Commitment, the school committee has high commitment, (b) Working together, can work together with the community, and the school. However, it is realized that there are still some shortcomings that need to be corrected, such as meetings or meetings conducted by the School Committee, which are not scheduled, meaning that there are no regular meetings held monthly or quarterly, and there are even School Committees that only hold meetings twice a year. Ideally, the management meetings are held every month or at least once every two months, but due to the many activities of the management the meetings do not take place, eventually the meetings are held depending on the needs of the school, for example when new students are admitted and there are student problems, (c) Analyzing aspirations, The school committee also analyzed the aspirations of the community, both the school's internal and external community, (d) Provide input, all complaints submitted by parents of students are still accommodated by the school committee which will then be submitted to the principal in charge of this matter, (e) Providing recommendations, until now the school committee has established a good relationship with the community, especially parents of students, where every important thing is to be carried out in the school, the committee still invites parents to hold a meeting

and then the results of the discussion are conveyed to the school and the school committee, (f) Participating, managing educational resources, by identifying conditions in school resources and community resources, mobilizing community assistance for education in schools and coordinating community assistance. In terms of the liaison in the management of educational resources, the School Committee is still lacking a role, not yet up to fundraising from the public such as the business world and the industrial world or people who care about education.

Implementation of the duties of the school committee, which consists of: (a) Raising funds, the local government of Cipayung Subdistrict gives sufficient attention to the Cipayung District School Committee by providing financial support, facilities and infrastructure, and human resources. With the support of the Cipayung Subdistrict government, the School Committee has smoothed the implementation of its programs. However, the School Committee has not maximally cooperated with employers to be involved in raising funds so that they only hope for contributions from parents and the government, (b) Following up on complaints, suggestions, criticisms, the School Committee also follows up on various complaints, suggestions and criticisms from the community so that suggestions from the community are not ignored as well as for the progress of the school.

The implementation of the role of the school committee, which consists of (a) advisory agency, the School Committee as a consideration body has the role of implementing a program such as the first, school planning, namely, providing input on the preparation and approval of the RAPBS, holding RAPBS meetings (schools, parents, students, communities) as well as give consideration about changes in the RAPBS. The second is in terms of program implementation, by providing input on the process of education management and learning process to teachers. The third role is in terms of managing educational resources, by giving consideration to the teaching staff that can be seconded at school, about facilities and infrastructure that can be seconded at school and the budget that can be utilized at school, (b) Supporting (supporting agency), Cipayung District School Committee expressed support for the Principal's programs in the Field of Education related to increasing the education budget, providing scholarships for outstanding students, giving school uniforms to underprivileged students, actively involved in the committee, supporting the empowerment of the committee, (c) Controlling (controlling agency), School committees carry out their role as controllers, such as school planning must be known to the committee at all times, monitor the learning process of students what additional lessons need to be held, monitor the state of students who should be assisted. The committee also monitors student extracurricular activities, such as student council activities, boy scouts and youth red cross, monitors the implementation of school programs, with school organizations, monitors school program scheduling.

4. Product

In the product aspect related to improved performance which consists of better education services, task completion, professional performance so it can be explained below:

Educational services are getting better, School Committees and teachers strive to improve harmonious relations between schools and communities that are contained in the organization of school committees, able to optimize the participation of parents and the community in advancing educational programs in forms such as; parents and community help provide educational facilities, provide financial assistance as well as thoughts or contribute suggestions needed for school progress. Parents and the community are expected to provide information to schools about the potential of their children and foster parents and community understanding of the educational programs that are needed by the community. The findings regarding the role of school committees in improving teacher performance related to the quality of school services of classification researchers into six indicators of a school's quality services.

Task completion, School committees and teachers in their more active roles in the administration of education in the form of providing support in the implementation of programs in schools and liaising between the community and the school. As a partner of the school the school committee has been running well, especially in supporting school programs, but as a controlling body the school committee is still minimal as evaluating the use of the school budget, has not been actively involved in every school planning.

Professional, School Committee and Cipayung District teachers work professionally in carrying out their

roles and functions. The school committee realizes that as a school of consideration for schools it means that the school committee is seen as the work partner of the school principal who can be consulted about the future of the school. All school programs that will be implemented are always consulted with the school committee. This is because, the program to be implemented or to be implemented is inseparable from the internal and external participation of the school.

Achievement, the Cipayung District School Committee and teachers are actively involved in improving student achievement. This can be seen by several programs launched by the School Committee to trigger students' enthusiasm for learning such as providing assistance to high-achieving students, helping underprivileged students, and holding intelligent quizzes for students. However, school committees and teachers realize that what they are doing is not fully maximized and there are still some obstacles such as lack of funds. But this does not reduce the motivation and enthusiasm of the School Committee and teachers to advance student achievement. Although the school committee does not play a direct role in the learning process in the classroom, it can create various extracurricular activities programs that can be offered to the school principal.

Conclusion

The results showed that the purpose of forming a school committee consisting of channeling aspirations, being responsible, transparent, accountable, and democratic. But there is no specific schedule to absorb the aspirations of the people. Recruitment is not fully carried out through procedures established by statutory regulations, the selection committee for prospective members of the School Committee is not formed and determined by the Principal but by members of the Demissionary School Committee. The implementation of the functions, tasks and roles of the school committee has run well, but the school committee has not maximally cooperated with the business and industry sectors. Improved performance consisting of better education services, task completion, professionals in carrying out their roles and functions as well as improving student achievement.

Recommendation There are a number of recommendations that need to be submitted as an effort to improve, develop and improve the program. Following are the recommendations of researchers including;

1. School committees need to make a special schedule to absorb the aspirations of the community.
2. School committees need to increase the sense of responsibility among school committees.
3. Transparency in the use of the budget should be increased.
4. Do not include political elements in the recruitment of school committees.
5. Schedule regular meetings between school committees and school authorities.
6. Can increase cooperation with business and industry to get budget assistance.

Reference

- [1.] Res, I. J. A., & Maria, K. (2016). Evaluation tool for the Forecasting initial Evaluation of school Environmental projects: a case study. *International Journal of Advanced Research*, 5(1), 2938–2948. <https://doi.org/10.21474/IJAR01/3095>
- [2.] Carpenter, D., Corbin, R., & Luke, N. (2016). *Assessment of Operational Effectiveness for Education Program Providers* Linked references are available on JSTOR for this article : *Assessment of Operational Effectiveness for Education Program Providers*. 4(2), 103–115.
- [3.] Fitzpatrick, J. L., Sanders, J. R., & Worthen, B. R. (2004). *Program Evaluation Alternative Approaches and Practical Guideline*. Boston: Pearson Education Limited.
- [4.] Cimmings, T. G., & Christopher G., W. (2015). *Organizational Behavior Managing People and Organizations*. USA: Cengage Learning.
- [5.] Griffin, R. W., & Moorhead, G. (2014). *Organizational Behavior Managing People and Organizations*. Canada: South-Western Cengage Learning.
- [6.] Alcamo, J. (2017). Evaluating the impacts of global environmental assessments. *Environmental Science and Policy*, (October 2016), 0–1. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2017.03.009>
- [7.] Dorval, E., Thornby, K., Ottman, A., & Hubbard, M. (2017). Useful Resources For Members Serving On A Curriculum Committee In Schools and Colleges Of Pharmacy. *International Journal Currents in Pharmacy Teaching and Learning*, 9(1), 145–154. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cptl.2016.08.050>.

- [8.] Koç, E. S. (2015). An evaluation of the effectiveness of committees of teachers according to the teachers' views, Ankara province sample. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174, 3–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.618>.
- [9.] Sukirno. (2006). *Pedoman Kerja Komite Sekolah*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Widyatama.
- [10.] Okitsu, T., & Edwards, D. B. (2017). Policy Promise And The Reality Of Community Involvement In School-Based Management In Zambia: Can The Rural Poor Hold Schools And Teachers to Account? *International Journal of Educational Development*, 56(2), 28–41. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.07.001>.
- [11.] Mitchell, R. (2017). Democracy or Control? The Participation Of Management, Teachers, Students And Parents In School Leadership in Tigray, Ethiopia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 55(March), 49–55. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.05.005>
- [12.] Sony, M., & Mekoth, N. (2016). The Relationship between Emotional Intelligence, Frontline Employee Adaptability, Job Satisfaction and Job Performance. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 30(2), 20–32. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2015.12.003>.
- [13.] Maisarah, N., Ghani, A., Sara, N., Muhamad, N., & Saiful, N. (2016). Leader's Personality Traits and Employees Job Performance in Public Sector, Putrajaya. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 37(16), 46–51. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671\(16\)30091-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(16)30091-0).
- [14.] Ohme, M., & Zacher, H. (2015). Job Performance Ratings: The Relative Importance of Mental Ability, Conscientiousness, and Career Adaptability. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 32(1), 1–32. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2015.01.003>.
- [15.] Mohamad, M., & Jais, J. (2016). Emotional Intelligence and Job Performance : A Study Among Malaysian Teachers. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 35(2), 674–682. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671\(16\)00083-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(16)00083-6).
- [16.] Lado, M., & Alonso, P. (2017). Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology A quantitative synthesis. *Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rpto.2017.07.004>.
- [17.] Colquitt, Le Pine, and W. (2011). *Organizational behavior: Improving Performance and Commitment in the work Place*. New Yor: McGraw-Hill Companies.
- [18.] Neyazi, N., & Arab, P. M. (2016). Evaluation of Selected Faculties at Tehran University of Medical Sciences Using CIPP Model in Students and Graduates Point of View. *Evaluation and Program Planning*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2016.06.013>.
- [19.] Hasan, A., Nurulhuda, S., Mohd, T., Fauzi, M., & Yunus, M. (2015). A Conceptual Framework for Mechatronics Curriculum Using Stufflebeam CIPP Evaluation Model. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 195, 844–849. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.06.324>.
- [20.] Barnes, N., Fives, H., & Dacey, C. M. (2017). U . S . teachers' conceptions of the purposes of assessment. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 65, 107–116. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2017.02.017>.
- [21.] Widyoko, E. P. (2009). *Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [22.] Stufflebeam, D. L., & Shinkfield, A. J. (2007). *Evaluation Theory, Models, and Applications*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass A Wiley Imprint.
- [23.] Suharsimi, A. (2004). *Prosedur Penelitian; suatu Pendekatan Praktek*. Bandung: Rineka Cipta.